

## ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION **MINUTES**

Tuesday, May 17, 2016 6:00 p.m. 50 W. Gay St. - First Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, David Cooke, Ben Goodman [arr. 6:07], Josh Lapp, Jason Sudy

Commissioners Absent: Rex Hagerling, Charmaine Sutton

City Staff Present: Cristin Moody

- I. CALL TO ORDER (6:05 p.m.).
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING - 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, June 14, 2016 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Conference Room A.
- NEXT COMMISSION MEETING 6:00 p.m., Tuesday, June 21, 2016 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference III. Room B.
- IV. **SWEARING IN OF STAFF**
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, April 19, 2016. MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VII. **PUBLIC FORUM**
- VIII. STAFF APPROVALS

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items (see below) into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application. MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED

IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

1. 16-5-16

### **697 North Fourth Street**

### **Crystal Park (Applicant)**

### **Lykens Properties (Owner)**

Following the staff report, discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated. Approve Application #16-5-16, 697 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: New Signage

Retain the existing awning signage that was installed prior to review and approval as part an episode of "Restaurant Impossible."

### **Outdoor Seating**

Retain the existing stools and umbrellas as installed in the previously approved smoking area.

Note: The sign change has already made. It is approved due to the fact that it is a non-illuminated sign and appears to be a vinyl strip that would be fairly easy to remove. The umbrellas are approved on the condition that they do not overhang onto the sidewalk.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED.



### 2. 16-5-17

#### 995 North Fourth Street

### **Brad Parish/Archall (Applicant)**

### **Capitol Equities (Owner)**

Following the staff report, discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated. Approve Application #16-5-17, 995 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

### **Expand Dumpster Enclosure**

- Expand the previously approved dumpster enclosure, with additional access door and to include a walk-in cooler, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- The height of the walk-in cooler is 7' 11", with no equipment mounted on top of the cooler.
- Previously approved height and proposed height of enclosure is 8'.
- Previously approve dimensions are 16' x 9'. Proposed dimensions to be 16' x 16' 11".

MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

### 3. 16-5-18

### 1087 Say Avenue

### Audra & Lacey Wheeler (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated. Approve Application #16-5-18, 1087 Say Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

## Modify Previous Approval/Carriage House

• Change the two single 8' x 8' doors to one (1) double, 16' x 8' door that has the appearance of two carriage house doors, per the submitted drawings.

### Remove Entrance Landing

• Eliminate the previously approved door, steps, and landing on the southeast side of the garage and replace with a window opening, per the submitted elevation drawings.

MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

### 4. 16-5-19

### 1126 North High Street

### **Greg Tishkoff (Applicant)**

### SG Real Estate Partners, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #16-5-16, 1126 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

## Modify Previous Approval/Storefront Windows

- Install new folding window system in the existing storefront.
- Existing center mullion to be eliminated, per the submitted elevation drawings. The center stiles, where the bifold panels come together and lock is to be at least as wide as shown on submitted rendering, or wider, up to the width of the center mullion on the transom window above.
- The center trim dividing the two panels on the base of the storefront should match the width of the mullion on the transom above it.
- Change is being requested to create a continuous 8.5' window opening.
- Storefront to be painted black and brown, per the submitted rendering.

MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (4-0-1 [Cooke]) APPROVED

### 5. 16-5-20

### 127 East Fifth Avenue

### Ali Alshahal (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated. Application #16-5-20 was divided into item 'a' for the pole sign, and item 'b' for the awning sign.

### 16-5-20a

Approve Application #16-5-20a, 127 East Fifth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted Reface Existing Pole Sign

• Retain the existing, new, plastic faces on the existing pole sign, per the submitted photograph. Sign to be internally illuminated.

Note: The reasons for this approval: The existing is an inactive sign and it is preferable to have it activated than left blank; this is one of the few remaining vestiges of the auto-oriented corridor and will likely be removed as the character of the area changes; the Commission approved a similar sign here for the previous business.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) APPROVED.

#### 16-5-20b

Continue Application #16-5-20b, 127 East Fifth Avenue, and place on the June 21, 2016 meeting agenda as a holdover.

### **Install New Awning Signs**

• Install two (2) new, black, fabric awnings on Fifth Avenue and Summit Street, per the submitted rendering. MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

#### 6. 16-5-21

### **1062 Hamlet Street**

### Phil Cydrus/Miami Valley Garages (Applicant)

### Mike Miller (Owner)

Following the staff report, discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated. Application #16-5-21 was divided into item 'a' for the demolition and item 'b' for the new construction.

#### 16-5-21a

Approve Application #16-5-21a, 1062 Hamlet Street, as submitted:

### Demolish Garage

• Demolish the existing, concrete block, single-car garage.

Note: This demolition approved because the garage was determined to be non-contributing due to its age and small footprint.

MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.

#### 16-5-21b

Approve Application #16-5-21b, 1062 Hamlet Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

### **Build New Garage**

- Build a new, 24' x 22', detached garage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Siding to be 5" pine.
- Roofing pitch to be 6/12 with GAF "Nickel Gray" 3-tab, asphalt shingles.
- Soffit to be plywood with 1 x 6 fascia boards.
- Corner boards and trim to be 1 x 4.
- Garage is to have two (2) single car overhead doors. Finish to be smooth or pebble finish, not faux wood-grain finish.
- Garage is to have two gooseneck lights on the alley side.
- Garage is to have a visible foundation.
- A cut sheet for the garage doors, light fixtures, and details on the gutters and downspouts are to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.
- One steel pedestrian door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED.

### **HOLDOVERS**

#### 7. 16-2-9b

### 638-642 North High Street

### **Keith Witt/Behal Sampson Dietz (Applicant)**

**Armbrust Properties, Ltd. (Owner)** 

At the request of the Applicant, table Application #16-2-9b, 638-642 North High Street for 60 days from the date of this meeting.

### **Install New Energy Panels**

- Remove the existing, faded energy panels, and install new, painted wood panels over the existing missing and damaged Luxfer prism glass transom window system on the west elevation of the storefront (N. High St.).
- New wood trim, panel molding, and paint color to match existing.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) TABLED.

### 8. 16-4-20

#### 901 North Fourth Street

## Victor Investments, Ltd./ 4<sup>th</sup> Street Partners, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application #16-4-20, 901 North Fourth Street, and place on the June 21, 2016 meeting agenda as a holdover.

### New Construction/Landscape Plan

• Install new hardscape and plantings, per the submitted site plan, materials list and plantings list.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

### 9. 16-4-21

### 847 Hamlet Street

### **Mulberry (Applicant)**

### 847 Hamlet Street, LLC. (Owner)

At the request of the Applicant, continue Application #16-4-21, 847 Hamlet Street, and place on the June 21, 2016 meeting agenda as a holdover. This is the second and final continuance for this application.

### Demolition

• Demolish the existing, one-story, single-family dwelling.

### **New Construction**

- Construct a new, two-story, single-family dwelling, per the submitted drawings.
- Construct a new, two-car garage with loft/office space, per the submitted drawings.

MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

### VARIANCE RECOMMENDATIONS

#### 10. 16-5-22

### 944 North Fourth Street

### **Quinn Fallon (Applicant/Owner)**

Following staff report, additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Upon review of Application #16-5-22, 944 North Fourth Street, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variance, as follows:

### Request for Variance Recommendation

- 1) 3332.039, R-4, Residential district uses, to allow an eating and drinking establishment
- 2) 3312.49(C) Minimum numbers of parking spaces required, to reduce required parking spaces from 25 to 2 spaces for a 2,100 square-foot eating and drinking establishment with a 700 square foot roof-top patio

- 3) 3332.05, Area district lot width requirements, to maintain a reduced minimum lot width of 37 feet (50 feet is required)
- 4) 3332.15, R-4 Area district requirements, to maintain the existing reduced lot area of 3,594 square feet (5000 square feet is required).
- 5) Section 3321.05(8)(2), Vision clearance, requires that a thirty (30) foot right angle clear vision triangle shall be maintained on each residential lot adjacent to a street intersection, while the applicant proposes to maintain no clear vision triangle at the intersection of East Barthman and South Washington Avenues; and
- 6) Section 3332.1B(D), Basis of computing area, limits buildings from occupying more than fifty (50) percent of the lot area, while the applicant proposes to maintain an increased lot coverage of ninety (90) percent; and
- 7) 3332.26(C)(1), Minimum side yard permitted, to maintain a minimum side yard of O feet (3 feet is required)
- 8) 3332.27, Rear yard, to maintain a rear yard (including parking lot) of 237 square feet or 6.6% (25% is required). MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (5-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

### 11. 16-5-23

#### 911 North Fourth Street

### John A. Gleason (Applicant)

### Victor Investments, Ltd. (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #16-5-23 Commissioner Boyer noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings and exited the hearing room. Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Upon review of Application #16-5-23, 911 North Fourth Street, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variance, as follows:

### Request for Variance Recommendation

- 1) Allow 2 Dwellings; one with four Dwelling Units and one with 3 Dwelling Units (3332.039).
- 2) Reduction in the number of parking spaces from 12 to 7 (3312.49 (C)).
- 3) Increase in lot coverage from 50% to 85% (3332.15).
- 4a. Decrease in the side yard setback from 5 feet to 1 foot (3332.26).
- 4b. Allow the Project to front on College Alley, which is not a "public street" (3332.19).
- 4) A reduction in the R-4 area district requirements from 10,500 square feet to 7,405 square feet (3332.15).
- 5) Reduction in the building lines to 5 feet 6 inches (3332.21).
- 6) Reduction in the maximum side yards to 3.9 feet (3332.25).
- 7) Reduction in the rear yard to 1 foot (3332.27).
- 8) Waive the requirement to provide an on-site dumpster; the Project will opt out of the City of Columbus refuse service and provide private hauling of refuse (1309.01).
- 9) Waive the requirement of a bulk storage location (3372.569)

MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (4-0-1 [Boyer]) RECOMMENDED

### 12. 16-5-24

### 1124 North Fourth Street

## Damado1, LLC c/o Dave Perry, Agent (Applicant/Owner)

Prior to review of Application #16-5-24, Commissioner Lapp noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings. Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Upon review of Application #16-5-24, 1124 North Fourth Street, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as follows:

### Request for Variance Recommendation

- 1) 3309.14(A), Height Districts, to permit a 46' (max) tall building in the H-35 district.
- 2) 3333.15(C), Basis of Computing Area, to increase permitted lot coverage (building) from 50% to 64%.
- 3) 3333.18, Building Lines, to reduce the N Fourth Street and E 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue building setback lines from 40' (Thoroughfare Plan) and 14' to seven (7) feet and zero (0) feet, respectively.
- 4) 3333.23(b)(d), Minimum Side Yard Permitted, to reduce the minimum side yard on the north side of the building, adjacent to E Greenwood Avenue (32', alley), from 7.67' (one-sixth building height) to zero (0) feet.
- 5) 3333.24, Rear Yard, to reduce rear yard from 25% of lot area to 18%.
- 6) 3333.26, Height District, to permit a 46' (max) building in the H-35 district.
- 7) 3312.13(B), Driveway, to reduce the width of the driveway entrance to the enclosed parking area from 20' to 18'.
- 8) 3312.27(3), Parking Setback Line, to reduce the E 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue parking setback line from 14' to 7'.
- 9) 3312.49, Minimum Numbers of Parking Spaces Required, to reduce code required parking for 36 dwelling units from 54 spaces to 46 spaces (1.27/DU)
- 10) 3321.05, Vision Clearance, to reduce the required vision clearance at the entrance/exit for the enclosed parking level on E Greenwood Avenue (alley) from a 10' vision clearance triangle to a 5' vision clearance triangle; to reduce the required vision clearance at E Greenwood Avenue (alley) and the unnamed east 15' alley from a 10' vision clearance triangle to a 2' vision clearance triangle to permit a trash enclosure, as noted on the site plan; to reduce the required vision clearance at E 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue and the unnamed 15' alley from a 10' vision clearance triangle to an 8' vision clearance triangle; and to reduce the clear vision triangle at the intersection of N Fourth Street and E 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue from 30' to 14'.

### Request for Rezoning Recommendation

- Rezone the existing 0.40 +/- acres located on the east side of North Fourth Street (60'), between East Fourth Avenue (60') and East Greenwood Avenue (32'), from the R-4, Residential District to the AR-3, Apartment Residential District.
- Applicant proposes to develop the site with a 36 dwelling unit apartment building, as depicted on the submitted site plan.

MOTION: Boyer/Cooke (4-0-1) RECOMMENDED [Lapp].

### **NEW APPLICATIONS**

#### 13. 16-5-25

### 990 North High Street

### Jonas Laughlin (Applicant)

### Wood Company (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #16-5-25, 990 North High Street, and place on the June 21, 2016 meeting agenda as a holdover. <u>Install New Directional Sign</u>

- Install one (1) new wall sign, per the submitted rendering.
- New matte finish, 3M vinyl adhesive sign to measure 12' W x 3' H.
- Directional graphic points toward business in neighboring building at 15 E. Second Avenue.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

### 14. 16-5-15b

### 642 North High Street, Ste. B (facing Russell St.)

### Luxe Bridal, LLC. (Applicant)

### Richard Bruggeman/Brugge Properties (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #16-5-15b, 642 North High Street, Ste. B, and place on the June 21, 2016 meeting agenda as a holdover.

### Install New Directional Wall Sign

- Install one (1) new wall sign, per the submitted rendering.
- Directional graphic points toward business entrance on Russell Street.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

### 15. 16-5-26

### 1059 Say Avenue

### Jim Saltz (Applicant)

### **Chris Perry (Owner)**

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #16-5-26, 1059 Say Avenue, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

### New Windows/Existing House

• Retain the existing, Marvin, Integrity, fiberglass windows, as installed.

### New HardiePlank Siding/Existing House

- Retain the existing section of 4" cementitious siding on the south elevation, as installed.
- Install cementitious siding on all elevations.

## New Door/Existing House

• The installed half-light, two-panel steel door is to be replaced with historically appropriate wood door. A cut sheet for the new door is to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to installation.

### New Addition/West Elevation

• Install two (2) horizontal windows in place of the approved one (1) double-hung window.

### New Addition/Exterior Siding

• The board-and-batten siding that has been installed with faux-wood grain exposed is to be flipped so that the smooth side is exposed.

### New Addition/Asphalt Shingles

• Retain the existing asphalt shingles, as installed. Ridge roll is to be modified to be appropriate, as approved by staff.

### Garage Door

• Replace the inappropriate garage door that was installed with a new, overhead door as shown in the approved drawings. A cut sheet for the new door is to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final approval.

### Other Required Modifications

All overhangs and eaves are to be restored, as shown in the previously approved drawings; the added trim piece
over the gables is to be removed; the decorative brackets are to be installed as previously approved; the window
trim as installed on the first story is acceptable and is to be replicated on the second story windows.

Note: Fiberglass windows are approved based on their high quality and dimensions and profile, as well as the fact that the previous windows were non-contributing, aluminum-clad windows. This and all other work is approved for this situation only, due to the unique and pressing situation, and does not establish a precedent.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

#### 16. 16-5-27

### **162 East Fourth Avenue**

### **Kyle Wefler (Applicant/Owner)**

In the absence of the applicant, Commissioners present made the following comments regarding the request and took no action.

### New Parking Pad

• Install a new 10' wide x 23' deep parking pad, per the submitted site plan.

### **Commissioner Comments**

- Will consider the curb cut but would like to see the sidewalk extended and will need to understand what will happen with the pole that is in the way.
- The materials used in the parking pad should be pervious and/or pavers.
- The curb cut would be considered in this case because of the property's limitations and the way Hamlet Street is in that location.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

#### 17, 16-5-13b

### 775 Summit Street

### **Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)**

### **Steve Hurtt (Owner)**

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #16-5-13b, 775 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

### Install HardiePlank Siding

• Remove the existing T-111 siding on the rear addition, and install new, 5" exposure, horizontal, HardiePlank siding, per the submitted drawing.

Note: Approval is based the fact that it is a non-original addition which has been highly modified.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) APPROVED.

### 18. 16-5-28

### 920 North High Street

### Mark Olson (Applicant)

### **Emerald ECP Short North (Owner)**

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #16-5-28, 920 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

### Modify Previous Approval/Front Entrance Door

- Eliminate the previously approved revolving door at the south end of the façade.
- Install a new vestibule with the appearance of the original design of standard storefront doors, per the submitted drawings.

Note: This approval does not include any signage. MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (4-1 [Cooke]-0) APPROVED

### 19. 16-5-29

### 920 North High Street

### **Emerald ECP Short North (Applicant/Owner)**

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #16-5-29, 920 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

### Install New Mural

- Install new mural, on the south elevation of new construction, per the submitted renderings.
- Mural is to remain in place for up to one year or until the vinyl starts to deteriorate. Art can be moved down a few masonry courses on the same wall, with revised rendering submitted to staff.
- Install frame on masonry wall around mural, for future temporary banner signage, with specific frame details to be submitted and reviewed by Historic Preservation Office staff prior to installation. Each temporary banner sign is to be submitted to the Italian Village Commission for approval prior to installation.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED

### 20. 16-5-30

### 1100 North High Street

### Jeffery Parenteau (Applicant)

### Giannopoulus Properties, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated. Application #16-5-30 was divided into item 'a' for the patio roof and item 'b' for the new light fixture and signage.

### 16-5-30a

Approve Application #16-5-30a, 1100 North High Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

### Patio Roof

- Install a standing seam metal roof over the patio area on the south side of the building and gutters as shown in the submitted drawing labeled A3.
- Color of the metal roof is to be black; the decking, fascia and all wood on the structure are to be painted black.

Note: The walk-in cooler and enclosure are not part of this approval. Any fans or lighting for the patio area are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for approval.

MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED

### 16-5-30b

Continue Application #16-5-30b, and place on the June 21, 2016 meeting agenda as a holdover.

### Light Fixtures

- Install new carriage light fixtures at front entrance, per the submitted photo example (B).
- Install four (4) new gooseneck light fixtures on the south elevation, per the submitted photo example.

### Install New Signage

• Install new signage on the south side of the building, per the submitted rendering options C, D, and E.

MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

#### 21, 16-4-26

### Jeffrey Park/Phase IV/Waldron Street

## **Robert Harris (Applicant)**

### Jeffrey New Day, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #16-4-26, Jeffrey Park/Phase IV/Waldron Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted New Construction/Phase IV

- Construct 258 new residential units, per the submitted drawings.
- Phase IV includes four architectural styles for the residential buildings.

- The parking garage is not included in this approval.
- More complete construction package and a full landscape plan, including the details on the nature and characteristics of the park space, trees, the connections between the greenspaces and the greater project, the space between the buildings, the streetscapes, to be submitted for later review.

Note: The water table need another study on buildings J, E, G, & D, to be reviewed by Historic Preservation Office staff in consultation with IVC Vice Chair Boyer.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED.

### 22. 16-4-25

## Jeffrey Park/ Phase V/NE Corner of North Fourth Avenue and Warren Street Robert Harris (Applicant) Jeffrey New Day, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #16-4-25, Jeffrey Park/Phase V/NE Corner of North Fourth Avenue and Warren Street.

### New Construction/Phase V

- Construct two new, five-story condominium buildings, per the submitted drawings.
- Phase V includes 104 condominium units with three architectural styles.
- North Fourth Street and North Sixth Street are faced at ground floor with townhome units.
- All masonry selections, steps, handrails, streetscapes, and interior parking lot landscape plan are to be submitted for further review.

Note: A corrected rendering is to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED.

### 23. 16-4-24

### 152 East Second Avenue

### Matt & Sara Canterbury (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #16-4-24, 152 East Second Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

## Carriage House

- Construct a new carriage house/garage in the rear lot of the existing property, per the drawing submitted May 17, 2016, showing a reduced building height, elimination of Juliet balcony and other minor revisions.
- Two-car garage to have efficiency apartment on second story.
- Install new wood privacy fence, as shown on submitted plans.
- Landscape plan and streetscape is to be submitted for further review.

Note: Patio area with outdoor kitchen is not part of this approval.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

### 24. 16-5-31

### Corner of Lincoln Street & Pearl Street

### David Vottero/Schooley Caldwell & Assoc. (Applicant)

### The Wood Companies (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #16-5-31, Corner of Lincoln Street & Pearl Street, as submitted.

### **Build New Parking Garage**

- Construct a new, split level, 244 space parking garage.
- Garage to be accessed from Pearl Street.
- Residential apartments to face Lincoln Street, and small retail space to be at the southwest corner of the site, per submitted drawings, including elevations, materials, colors and windows.
- Signage, landscape plan and lighting are to be submitted for future review.

Note: Brick sidewalks and sandstone curbs are recommended, especially on Lincoln Street. Applicant may return with a study of railings on the south elevation as well as more information on the entry to the garage.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED.

#### 25, 16-5-32

### 848 Pearl Street

### Connie J. Klema, attny. (Applicant)

### **Wood Run Partners, LLC. (Owner)**

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Sudy opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

### **Commissioner Comments**

<u>Sudy:</u> Commission will need to see a clear study of access to parking and agreements that will accommodate the use. The use is a good way to diversify the neighborhood.

<u>Lapp</u>: It will fit with the City's interest in offsetting the lack of demand for parking during the day

<u>Boyer:</u> HVAC demands will be greater for office use, so the overall height may increase with the mechanical units on the roof.

<u>Cooke</u>: Concerned about being sensitive to the houses that remain, especially with increasing the building height.

#### New Construction/Use

• Conceptual discussion regarding the use of the space in the new building.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

### 26. 16-5-33

### 1024 North Sixth Street/rear (facing onto East Alley)

### **Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

#### The New Victorians (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #16-5-33, Chairperson Sudy noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings and exited the hearing room. Vice-Chairperson, Boyer, assumed the role of Chairperson.

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #16-5-33, 1024 North Sixth Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

### **New Construction**

- Construct new, brick, warehouse style house and detached garage, per the revised drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be a combination of brick and hardi-board or metal siding.
- Window sills to be brick.
- Windows to be aluminum-clad wood.
- Roof color, light fixtures and revised plans showing brackets on the shed awnings, are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: Garage to be slightly higher than shown in submitted plans. Roof color and lighting to be submitted for future review. The applicant will add a bracket to the shed awning, with drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with Vice Chair Boyer.

MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (4-0-1) APPROVED [Sudy]

### 27. 16-5-34

### 185 Punta Alley

### **Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

### Michael & Michelle Maurer (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #16-5-34, 185 Punta Alley, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

## New Construction

- Construct a new 2-3 story single-family dwelling, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be a combination of brick, metal, and stucco, per the submitted material samples.
- Roof coping to be metal.

- Rear doors and garage doors to have limestone lintels.
- Light fixtures, landscape and streetscape plans to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff prior to issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: Approval is with the understanding that revisions to the east elevation, based on Commissioner Comments, will be submitted for Italian Village Commission review at the next regular meeting.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (4-1-0) APPROVED [Goodman]

### 28. 16-4-29

### 849 Summit Street (Existing Residence/North Lot)

### **Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

### **Blue Chip Development LLC. (Owner)**

Prior to review of Application #16-4-29, Commissioner Goodman noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings and exited the hearing room. Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated. Application #16-4-29 was divided into item 'a' for the demolition and building alterations, and item 'b' for the variance recommendation.

#### 16-4-29a

Approve Application #16-4-29a, 849 Summit Street (Existing Residence/North Lot), as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

#### Demolition

• Remove the existing, non-original, non-contributing carport and shed.

### Renovation & Addition/House

- Construct new two-story addition.
- Restore, repair, or replace siding. Siding to be 5 ½" HardiPlank siding.
- Install new windows, as needed, per the Historic Preservation Office site visit. Install new window on the front elevation.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (4-0-1) APPROVED [Goodman].

#### 16-4-29b

Upon review of Application #16-4-29b, 849 Summit Street (Existing Residence/North Lot), the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variance, as follows:

### Request for Variance Recommendation

- 1) 3332.05 (4) Area District Lot Width To Allow the Width to be Less Than 50' And Be 18'-10"
- 2) 3332.15 R4 Area District Requirements To Allow the Width to be Less Than 5000 SF And Be 3497 SF
- 3) 3332.25 Maximum Side Yard To Be Less Than 20% Of Lot Width 5.3' And Be 3'-9 1/8"
- 4) 3332.26 I(1) Minimum Side Yard -To Allow the Minimum Side Yard to be Less Than 3' AND BE 9 1/4"
- 5) 3332.26I Garage Side Yard To Allow the Minimum Side Yard to be Less Than 3' AND BE 0"
- 6) 3312.49 Parking To Allow for the Parking Requirement to be Reduced From 2 Spaces to 1 Space

MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (4-0-1) RECOMMENDED [Goodman].

#### 29. 16-4-30

### 849 Summit Street (South Lot)

### Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

### **Blue Chip Development LLC. (Owner)**

Prior to review of Application #16-4-30, Commissioner Goodman noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings and exited the hearing room. Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated. Application #16-4-29 was divided into item 'a' for the new construction and item 'b' for the variance recommendation. Application #16-4-30 was divided into item 'a' for the demolition and new construction, and item 'b' for the variance recommendation.

### 16-4-30a

Approve Application #16-4-30a, 849 Summit Street (South Lot), as submitted, with all clarifications note: New Construction

- Construct new, two-story, frame, single-family dwelling.
- Siding to be 5 1/4" exposure Hardiplank.

- Roof pitch to be 9/12 with asphalt shingles from approved list.
- Front porch roof to be standing-seam-metal.
- Front door to be 3/4 –lite, wood door with transom.

### <u>Demolition and New Garage Construction</u>

- Construct new, two-car garage.
- Pedestrian door to be two-panel, half-lite.
- Overhead doors to be raised panel, steel doors.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (4-0-1) APPROVED [Goodman].

### 16-4-30b

Upon review of Application #16-4-30b, 849 Summit Street (South Lot), the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variance, as follows:

### Request for Variance Recommendation

- 1) 3332.05 (4) Area District Lot Width To Allow the Width to be Less Than 50' AND BE 18'-9"
- 2) 3332.15 R4 Area District Requirements To Allow the Area to be Less Than 5000 SF AND BE 3236 SF
- 3) 3332.26 I(1) Minimum Side Yard -To Allow the Minimum Side Yard to be Less Than 3' AND BE 1-10"
- 4) 3332.26I Garage Side Yard -To Allow the Minimum Side Yard to be Less Than 3' And Be 0"

MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (4-0-1) RECOMMENDED [Goodman]

### **STAFF APPROVALS**

#### • 16-5-1

### 22 East Fourth Avenue

### **Nicole Fleming (Applicant)**

### **Day Companies (Owner)**

Approve Application 16-5-1, 22 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: Install New Projecting Sign

- Install one (1) new projecting sign, per the submitted drawings.
- New sign to be double-faced, wood sign, framed in 1/8" black metal, with burnt wood lettering and graphic, per the submitted drawings.
- Sign to measure 2" H x 19.25" W (total 3.2 sq. ft.).
- Sign to be located on the masonry pier to the right of the front entrance door.

### Window & Door Graphics

- Install new window graphics in the three (3) transom windows, per the submitted rendering.
- Install new door graphic, per the submitted rendering.

### • **16-5-2** [Sudy]

### 248 East Third Avenue

### **New Victorians (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 16-5-2, 248 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood siding and trim elements and gable shingles, as necessary, per the submitted photographs. <u>All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.</u>
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color(s) to match existing.
- Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., stone foundation, etc.) is to remain unpainted.

#### • 16-5-3

### 1051 Summit Street

## Michael Maloof (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 16-5-3, 1051 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

### Restore Wood Siding

- Remove the existing, non-original, cedar shake siding on all elevations of the main block, to expose the original wood siding.
- Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Repair/replace any/all original, existing wood siding on the main block with any/all new wood siding to match the original wood siding profile and dimension exactly; like-for-like.
- Remove the existing, non-original, cedar shake siding on the bathroom addition located on the south side of the building. Install new wood siding on the bathroom addition, to match the existing wood siding in profile and dimension.
- Any/all repaired/replaced exterior trim elements (i. e. window & door trim, corner boards, eave soffit & fascia, crown moldings, etc.) to be restored to the original profile and dimension as determined by any/all existing, original trim and/or shadow lines following the removal of the cedar shake siding and any/all non-original trim repair patches.
- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces on all elevations of the building using the appropriate hand tools.
- Solid prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.
- The existing aluminum siding on the rear addition will remain in place at this time.

## Repair/Remove Picket Fence

- Repair or remove the existing wood picket fence from the front and side yards.
- If more than fifty per-cent of the existing wood pickets require replacing, Applicant is to contact Historic Preservation Office staff for consultation with the Italian Village Commission, to determine whether repair or removal is most appropriate.

### 16-5-4

### 1088-1090 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

### **Emily Tanoury & Colleen Will (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 16-5-4, 1088-1090 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: <a href="https://example.com/Porch Rehabilitation">Porch Rehabilitation</a>

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new, tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.
- Remove the existing, non-original porch railing and balusters, and install a new, wood privacy panel similar to the neighboring porch at 1084 Mt. Pleasant Avenue.
- Repair/replace porch skirting, as needed, like-for-like.
- Install new hand railings at steps, to match existing.

### **Exterior Painting**

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.

### **Transoms**

• Remove the existing metal panels that cover the two (2) transoms, and repair/replace any wood or glass, as needed, like-for-like.

### Landscaping

- Remove the existing shrubs in front of the porch and install new planting bed.
- Following examination by an arborist, Applicant has the option to trim or remove the large tree in the front yard, based on professional recommendation.
- If the tree is removed due to condition or inappropriate size for the small space, a new tree, of an appropriate size and species is to be planted in its place.

### • 16-5-5

### 87 East Fourth Avenue

### **Stephen Palmer (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 16-5-5, 87 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

### Complete Installation of New Windows

- Removal of aluminum windows on this ca. 1960, non-contributing apartment building, and installation of new vinyl windows was approved in 1998.
- Remove the two, remaining aluminum windows on the east elevation, and install new, vinyl sliding windows to match the existing vinyl windows.
- Remove the four (4) remaining aluminum windows on the west elevation, and install new, vinyl sliding windows to match the existing vinyl windows.

### **Install New Fence**

- Remove the existing section of chain-link fencing along the alley at the rear of the property, and install a new six-feet high (6' H), wood privacy fence in the same location.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence-finished side out facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

  Landscaping

### Landscaping

- Install new planting bed along the front/north side of the building.
- Plan for planting to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office for final review and approval, prior to installation.

### 16-5-6

### 950 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

## Tara Fox (Applicant)

Tara Fox & Jason Blakey (Owners)

Approve Application 16-5-6, 950 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: <a href="mailto:Exterior Painting/Front Porch">Exterior Painting/Front Porch</a>

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. <u>All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.</u>
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the front porch for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be per the submitted paint color chips.
- Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete, porch piers and columns, foundation etc.) is to remain unpainted.

#### • 16-5-7

### 777 North Fourth Street

### LC01 LLC (Applicant/Owners)

Approve Application 16-5-7, 777 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: Tuck Point & Repair Brick Walls

- Remove existing bricks, only as necessary, to make necessary repairs and to repair/replace any corroded, steel lintels.
- Any segmental, brick lintels to be reinstalled to match existing.
- Remove any/all damaged material on the parapet wall, and replace with like-for-like materials. Any/all replacement brick and/or capstone necessary is required to match the existing brick and/or capstone in original material type, size, color, and shape exactly (i. e. like-for-like).
- Check all mortar joints on all elevations for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Replace any/all missing damaged material and replace with new or used brick of the exact same shape, dimension, and color; like-for-like.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile.
- New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm).
- All work to be completed per the submitted engineer's report, dated March 28, 2016.
- Any site modifications are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Staff for review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to beginning work.

#### 16-5-8

#### **76 East Third Avenue**

### **Roger Farrell (Applicant/Owners)**

Approve Application 16-5-8, 76 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. <u>All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.</u>
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the front porch for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to match existing.
- Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone, lintels, foundation etc.) is to remain unpainted.

### 16-5-9

#### 938 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

## Judi Moseley & Steve Harper (Applicant/Owners)

Approve Application 16-5-9, 938 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. <u>All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.</u>
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be as follows: Trim "Snowbank" and Porch/Banisters "Knight's Armor."
- Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone, lintels, sills, foundation, porch piers and columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.

### • 16-5-10

### 251 Detroit Avenue

### Jason Rowland (Applicant)

### Ryan Osborn (Owner)

Approve Application 16-5-10, 251 Detroit Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Eave, Soffit & Fascia Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color to match existing.

### Repair Fence

• Repair the existing, board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), dog-eared, wood fence, as needed, like-for-like.

### • 16-5-11

## 956 North High Street

### **David Claar (Applicant)**

### BBR Holdings, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 16-5-11, 956 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: <u>Install New Door</u>

- Remove the existing, non-original, deteriorated, full-light steel door.
- Install a new full-light, steel door to match existing storefront doors, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- Color of new door to match existing storefront color.

#### • 16-5-12

#### **102 East Third Avenue**

### Jerry Stauffer (Applicant)

### Juliann E. South (Owner)

Approve Application 16-5-12, 102 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood siding and trim elements, as necessary. <u>All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.</u>
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to match existing.
- Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., stone/concrete foundation, etc.) is to remain unpainted.

#### • 16-5-13a

### 775 Summit Street

## **Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)**

### **Steve Hurtt (Owner)**

Application #16-5-13 has been divided into item 'a' for Italian Village Commission review under New Applications (see above), and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.

Approve Application 16-5-13a, 775 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

### Install New Door

• Remove the two (2), existing, non-original, steel doors, and install new, Therma-Tru, Smooth Star, full-view doors and full-view storm doors.

### Install New Window

- Remove the two (2), existing, non-original, plexi-glass windows.
- Create one (1) new window opening, and install a new, all-wood, interior/exterior, Marvin, one-over-one, double-hung sash window, per the submitted drawing.

### Repair Masonry Chimneys

- Rebuild the two (2) existing rear chimneys to match existing.
- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- Any/all new, stone chimney caps, coping, and corbelling to matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm).

## Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all (asphalt shingles/shingle-over slate) on the (main roof/carriage house/garage), down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:	Style:	Color:
[ ] CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	[] Stonegate Gray
[] GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	[] English Gray Slate
		[] Weathered Slate
[] Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	[] Nickel Gray
[] GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	[] Nickel Gray
[] Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	[] Estate Gray
[] Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	[] Antique Slate
All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or		
"Tinner's Red."		

- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

### Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the rear additions, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

### • 16-5-14

### **1149-1151 Summit Street**

### **Margaret Cole (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 16-5-14, 1149-1151 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: <u>Eave, Soffit, and Fascia Repair</u>

• Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

### Repair Slate Roof

• Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate on the main roof with new or used slate of the exact same color and profile and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

### Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm).

### **Exterior Painting**

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. <u>All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.</u>
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color to be white, to match existing.
- Any previously unpainted masonry (i.e., stone foundation) is to remain unpainted.
- Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

### Repair Masonry Foundation

- Remove any/all damaged stone and replace with stone that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm).
- The height, thickness, and length of the masonry wall is to remain the same following the completion of all repairs.

### Repair Windows

- Examine all windows on all elevations and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes. Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows.
- Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like. Replace all broken and missing glazing as needed.
- Replacement of any/all windows is not approved at this time.

### Repair Front Porch/1149 Summit St.

- In the interest of the preservation of the structure, retain the existing, wood porch flooring, fascia, and skirting, as installed.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
   Replace Porch Ceiling 1149 & 1151 Summit
- Remove and dispose of existing porch ceiling, pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing rafters to insure structural integrity
- insure structural integrity.
- Install a new porch ceiling nailed with galvanized finish nails.
- New material to be [] 1" x 3", tongue and groove, yellow pine, bead board or [] 4' x 8' Georgia-Pacific "Classic" style Ply-Bead (with sanded surface and 1/8" beaded pattern approx. 1.6" o.c.); prime exposed surface complete.
- Paint/stain color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

### Rebuild Rear Porch/1149 Summit St.

- Remove the existing, non-original, wooden, rear decking and steps.
- Install a new, concrete porch foundation, decking, and steps, to match the existing rear porch at 1051 Summit.
- Install new, shed roof at rear porch, to match existing rear porch at 1051 Summit.
- New support columns to be all wood, 4 x 4, wrapped, square columns (not to match the existing metal supports at 1051 Summit).

Drawing for the foundation, shed roof, and wood columns to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

### Repair Fence/1149 Summit St.

- Repair the existing double-loop, wire fencing in the rear yard.
- Replace wood posts, as needed, like-for-like.
- All horizontal and vertical wood posts to be firmly braced, with wire fencing stretched taut between vertical posts.
- Reinstall existing metal gate in existing location.
- Applicant has the option of removing the double-loop fence completely.

### Repair/Replace Fence/Front Yard

- Remove the existing, vinyl fencing in the front and side yard, which was installed prior to review or approval.
- Applicant is to submit a site plan and product cut sheet for new wood or metal fencing, for review and approval by the Italian Village Commission.

#### 16-5-15a

### 642 North High Street, Ste. B (facing Russell St.)

### Luxe Bridal, LLC. (Applicant)

### Richard Bruggeman/Brugge Properties Owner)

Application #16-5-15 has been divided into item 'a' for Italian Village Commission review under New Applications (see above), and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.

Approve Application 16-5-15a, 642 North High Street, Ste. B, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted: Install New Projecting Sign

- Install one (1) new projecting sign at the 642 North High Street, Ste. B entrance, facing onto Russell Street, per the submitted renderings.
- New metal sign to measure 3' x 3'.
- Applied vinyl text and graphics to read "La Jeune Mariee Maids & Social Occasions."
- Any/all fasteners for the black, metal bracket to be placed into mortar joints, not into the face of the brick.

### 16-5-35

### 30 E. 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue

### Dave Ramirez/R Design & Print Co. (Applicant)

### Fred Maloof (Properties Owner)

Approve Application 16-5-35, 30 E. 4th Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

### Repair/Replace Existing Wall Sign

- Repair/Replace existing wood base of wall sign to match existing and per submitted specifications (1.5'x11').
- New vinyl graphic to match existing per submitted drawing.

#### X. **OLD BUSINESS**

16-5-40

### **200 East Fourth Avenue**

### **Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

### Heidi Koestner & Andrew Losinski (Owners)

Discussion of modification to previous variance recommendation #15-11-24, recommended on 3-22-2016. A site plan was submitted.

Following discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken and results recorded, as indicated. Recommend approval of variance request 16-5-40, for additional variances related to the modified plan for previous recommendation #15-11-24, as submitted.

### Variance Request

- 1) 3312.49/3312.609 To reduce required parking to 7 spaces.
- 2) 3372.604 To maintain existing parking setback along East Fourth, North Fourth, and Greenwood Avenue.
- 3) 3312.25 To allow maneuvering from the lot onto Greenwood Avenue.

MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (5-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

## X. NEW BUSINESS

# XI. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (5-0-0) ADJOURNED (10:13 p.m.)